

Minutes of The Annual General Meeting of Association of National Board of Accredited Institutions (ANBAI)
at
Hyderabad
on
Saturday, the 8th Aug 2015
From 9.00 to 4.00 hrs,
Venue: Hotel Marigold, Greenlands, Begumpet, Hyderabad

1.	<p>Welcome address</p> <p>Prof. Dr. B. Bala Raju, President ANBAI - AP Chapter, welcomed all dignitaries and delegates to the ANBAI Annual General Meeting. He mentioned that it was a unique opportunity for Representatives from all institutions to interact amongst themselves and all concerned with regard to various issues pertaining to the training programs being conducted under the National Board of Examinations (NBE).</p>
2.	<p>Presidential address</p> <p>Dr. Alexander Thomas, President ANBAI, mentioned that even though ANBAI had been in existence only for 5 years and was hence a young institution, it had made some remarkable achievements. ANBAI had been working closely with NBE for improving quality of post graduate training in the Country. Its offshoot, AHPI, had made an impact in the country with over 10,000 institutions becoming its members. The no of members of ANBAI had increased and there were representatives of every state of the country. However there were some objectives, which still needed to be achieved. There were challenges both internal and external and ANBAI would focus on overcoming them in the coming months. There was the issue pertaining to parity of Medical Council of India (MCI) and NBE courses. Representatives of ANBAI had met the Health Minister and appealed to him to resolve the issue. Also the Governing Council of NBE had finished its tenure in October last year but the new Governing Council had still not been set-up. This was withholding action on issues like extra seats and convocation. The third issue was with regard to participation from within ANBAI to support its various activities. He appealed to various members to contribute actively to ANBAI activities.</p>
3.	<p>Address by Dr Bipin Batra, Executive Director NBE</p> <p>Dr. Bipin Batra, Executive Director of NBE thanked the AP Chapter of ANBAI for organizing the meeting. He briefed the members about the achievements of NBE. There had been good progress with regard to the uniform learning resource and the members could expect to be able to use it soon. Simultaneously NBE had been working to increase the capacity. The number of accredited PG seats had increased from 1900 in 2009 to 5500 in 2014 and was expected to cross 6500 soon. NBE was targeting a capacity of 10,000 plus seats by 2020.</p>

	<p>Dr Batra mentioned that NBE had been able to set up a valid and reliable examination system. The leadership of Dr. Reddy had been largely responsible for achievements in this regard.</p> <p>NBE had also been working on process indicators of quality of its post-graduate programs. The employability had some times been victimised but he expected that truth and justice would prevail.</p> <p>Dr. Batra pointed out that there were 15000 DNB postgraduates in US. There has been a move to set-up a Global alliance for DNB alumni outside India. The NBE programs had received International recognition. An International fellowship in Gastroenterology had been established with half of the training being conducted in Manchester and the other half in Sir Ganga Ram Hospital.</p> <p>The ratio of the number of students aspiring for MS/MD program at National level versus those who were successful was 1:5.5 whereas the ratio for DNB programme was 1:13. 16% of candidates appearing for DNB already have MS/MD.</p> <p>Another process indicator for NBE programs is the recognition of its faculty including award of academic titles. With regard to innovation, the process at NBE had been published as a case study in International Handbook of Medical Education.</p> <p>Dr. Batra sought the support of all stakeholders and assured a strategy for ongoing reforms.</p>
<p>4.</p>	<p>Address by Prof. Srinath Reddy, Chief Guest & Past President - NBE</p> <p>Prof. Srinath Reddy, Chief Guest & Past President - NBE spoke about the achievements of NBE including setting high standards for examination, elimination of biases as well as language barriers and getting in transparency along with objectivity. He recounted how he got the support of a very pro-active Governing body when he took over as President. There were good internal debates with the sole objective of improving processes and standards. Dr. Bipin Batra's dynamism had held bring in a lot of reform. He also recapitulated how Dr. Devi Shetty and Dr. Alexander Thomas had helped set up ANBAI and had been able to inculcate values amongst the members. He mentioned that there were some unfound apprehensions about quality being low in private hospitals. The quality of National Board Programs had now been well established. Even the Govt of Mauritius had asked help from NBE. He made a strong recommendation to members to be well-versed with research methodologies and to go in for multicentric research. He also suggested that NBE should continue its endeavours to train health personnel to meet the growing demand. He said that he would stay committed to the goals of NBE.</p>

5.	There was an interactive session of ANBAI members with Prof Bipin Batra during which the members raised various issues pertaining to NBE. The issue raised and the responses of Dr Bipin Batra were as under:-	
	a	<p>E-Learning Resource: NBE has to take a Decision</p> <p>Dr Batra informed the members that NBE had mooted an Elearning resource after consulting all stakeholders. It had been recommended that NBE should facilitate formation of a consortia in this regard. NBE authorised ANBAI to go ahead with the project. There had been a good progress and it was hoped that the resource would be launched soon. It would be endorsed by NBE.</p>
	b	<p>Seats to be enhanced for all NBE Renewal Institutions</p> <p>Dr Batra informed that 350 seats had been enhanced. Request had been accepted to enhance 554 seats in 326 departments. He also informed that the period of accreditation had been increased from 3 years to 4 years. All efforts were being made to bring in quality and standardization.</p>
	c	<p>Accepted protocols – institute is not receiving approvals</p> <p>Dr Batra mentioned that NBE was in the process of making changes. Approvals would be sent as downloadable pdf form and all concerned will be informed.</p>
	d	<p>Thesis topics approved by NBE should be displayed in NBE website</p> <p>Dr Batra informed that NBE was considering this and was deciding as to whether they should be displayed on public or retracted domain. NBE was also thinking of creating a portal of “to do thesis topics” and “not to do thesis topics”.</p>
	e	<p>Reduce frequency of inspections from 3 years to 5 years</p> <p>Dr Batra mentioned that the duration of accreditation had been increased to 4 years.</p>
	f	<p>Instead of rejection of inspection NBE has to give 2nd chance to the institute by rectifying the deficiencies</p> <p>Dr Batra informed the members that NBE was considering sending back observations of assessors. If any of the institutions felt that the judgement was not fair & was determined by extraneous factors, the concerned should feel free to write to him. NBE would also soon come out with Feedback form for assessors.</p>
	g	<p>In view of confidentiality issues there was a concern regarding submitting</p>

		<p>form – 16 to the inspectors –</p> <p>Dr Batra informed that NBE had already taken the necessary measures in this regard.</p>
	h	<p>Central counseling could be held in two places - North & South to reduce the numbers of dropout candidates</p> <p>Dr Batra mentioned that NBE was already considering this and it may be resolved soon. The other place could be Hyderabad or Bangalore.</p>
	i	<p>Enhancement of tuition fee from Rs. 70,000/- to Rs. 2,00,000/- yearly in Board & Rs. 3,00,000 for super specialty.</p> <p>Dr Batra mentioned that this was a Policy matter. It would be considered as and when the Governing Board is constituted.</p>
	j	<p>Dropout candidates should pay 3 years tuition fees at the time of Discontinuation of the course</p> <p>Dr Batra informed the members that the present law does not support this.</p>
	k	<p>Management quota for secondary courses to be introduced in NBE Central Counseling.</p> <p>Dr Batra mentioned that a decision could not be taken in this regard.</p>
	l	<p>To bring down the inspection / renewal fee which is enhanced to 2,00,000 from 50,000. Request to roll back</p> <p>Dr Batra mentioned that this was revised after 16 years. Since duration of accreditation was increased to 4 years, the renewal fee had been automatically reduced by 33%.</p>
	m	<p>Poor admissions in super specialties courses. After 3rd round of NBE central counseling NBE should give rights to institute to admit the candidates directly.</p> <p>Dr Batra mentioned that this was a policy decision. The poor admissions in super-specialty courses was mainly due to poor job opportunities.</p>
	n	<p>Bed strength should be 100 instead of 200 for minimum two specialty. 100 bedded institute can apply for two specialties at least.</p> <p>Dr Batra informed that NBE was in fact considering to increase it to 300. For single specialty it would be kept as 100.</p>

o	<p>Of late NBE is not informing the institutions about the date of annual appraisals which are conducted on regional basis, but directly informing to DNB residents. This attitude of bypassing the institutions and not keeping them informed is wrong. The institutions have to make appropriate arrangements in duty roster for residents. Also, the NBE is not providing any feedback on the student appraisal to the institutions directly. We have to depend on the students for same. But NBE promptly ask us for the feedback during renewal. How are we to provide this information?</p> <p>Dr Batra informed that now all communications were being sent to hospitals</p>
p	<p>The results of the final DNB examination are also not informed to the institutions. It is also not displayed in the web-site of NBE. The residents would have left the institute after completing the course by the time results are announced. The results are announced on the notice board of the NBE at Delhi. Only students in Delhi have access to this method of result announcement, whereas all over India, the residents have to keep telephoning the NBE office to know their results. There is a need for simultaneous announcement of results at the institution level. We also require this for updating the track record of students which is needed for renewal.</p> <p>Dr Batra mentioned that Head of institutions were also being informed.</p>
q	<p>We also are interested to know the entire subject wise results of the country as a whole, i.e. at the National Level every year. This will help us to know our performance whether we are above or below the National average of the outcome.</p> <p>Dr. Batra mentioned that this would be explored.</p>
r	<p>The NBE criteria categorically and unconditionally insists on anatomy, physiology, bio chemistry, microbiology, pharmacology and pathology training for the DNB students. Do we need basic sciences training at PG level? We have found that many accredited institutions are finding it difficult to comply with the criteria regarding basic sciences training. The applied aspects of basic sciences are dealt with by in-house faculty of the subject concerned.</p> <p>Dr. Batra informed the members about the rationale behind incorporating basic sciences in the curriculum. NBE was trying to explore the possibility of promoting some institutions to employ the faculty in this regard. Other institutions of the city could avail this services of these faculty on a nominal charge such that the employer could recover some expenses. This issue would be further addressed in accreditation reforms.</p>
s	<p>Faculty designation for DNB trainers: we, the faculty members of various</p>

		<p>subject request you to grant us the teaching designation in the form of professor, associate, assistant professor, etc., to add value to our contribution of teaching. This is because of the stringent guidelines laid down by the NBE for faculty status for DNB programmes. This is in addition to the hospital designation for e.g. consultant etc. You may please adapt the same criteria existing with the medical council of india (MCI) and let the NBE accredited institutions follow the guidelines laid down by you and provide the teaching designation. We ask for equivalence of MD/MS with DNB; why not the faculty designation too?</p> <p>Dr. Batra informed that a policy had already been announced. NBE has received 292 applications for professorship in next convocation.</p>
	t	<p>Inordinate delay in appointing assessors resulting in the process of reaccreditation getting delayed upto 2-3 years.</p> <p>Dr. Batra mentioned that NBE had laid down guidelines to accomplish 96% upward completion rate for all applications submitted within the year.</p>
	u	<p>Counseling process extending upto 6-9 months resulting in disruption of final exam schedule for trainees joining late.</p> <p>Dr. Batra mentioned that this is being streamlined.</p>
6	This was followed by a General Body Meeting of ANBAI.	
	a	<p>Apologies</p> <p>The members were informed about apologies from Dr Devi Shetty and Dr S Rajasekaran.</p>
	b	<p>Secretary's Report</p> <p>Dr H S Chhabra presented the Secretary's Report.</p>
	i	<p>Data Mining and updation of membership list</p> <p>The members were informed about data mining for updating the membership list of ANBAI. The list of accredited institutions had been taken from the website of NBE. Since the list was incomplete NBE was requested to give an updated list of accredited institutions. The updated list received includes 1620 institutions for 59 specialities. Technobrix was recruited for gathering information related to contact persons and contact details for each institution. Data was received in 3 instalments, on 16th February, 2015 for 60 institutions, on 27th February, 2015 for 141 institutions and on 15th July, 2015 for 441 institutions. The process is ongoing.</p>
	ii	<p>Periodic interactions amongst Governing Council members</p> <p>The members were informed that there had been periodic interactions amongst Governing Council members. Telephonic Conferences had been held on 8th</p>

		December, 2014, 18 th February, 2015, 19 th March, 2015 & 26 th March, 2015.
	iii	<p>Liasing with NBE & Government</p> <p>ANBAI had been Liasing with NBE to settle issues of Institutions & Students. It had been Liasing with Government to have parity between NBE & MCI courses.</p> <p>There was a discussion on liasing with the Government to have parity between NBE & MCI courses. The members unanimously resolved that the Ministry of Health, Government of India should be approached to look into this matter urgently and take corrective as well as strict measures to rectify the matter.</p>
	iv	<p>Uniform Learning Resource</p> <p>The members were informed that ANBAI has been partnering with National Board of Examinations for a Uniform Learning Resource which could aggregate all products from different publishers. ANBAI Governing Council approved formation of the Uniform Learning Resource Committee which has been authorized to take the proposal forward. The members of the committee included Dr. John Punnose, Dr. Madhuri Kanitkar, Dr. Padmaja, Dr. GovindHari, Dr. Ravi Shetty, Dr. Yatish Agarwal & Dr. H.S.Chhabra.</p> <p>Elsevier requested ANBAI to convey an acknowledgement of Elsevier as Knowledge Partner to ANBAI in this project. They needed this in order to facilitate their interaction with other publishers. Hence, after approval from the Governing Body of ANBAI, Uniform Learning Resource Committee of ANBAI was authorized to take a suitable decision on Elsevier's request. After approving this the decision had been conveyed to Elsevier.</p> <p>There had been periodic meetings with NBE & Publishers. A meeting was held with Dr. Bipin Batra in NBE office, Dwarka on 9th February 2015 with agenda of Pooling of Funds model & Plan of action: Key roles and responsibilities and way forward.</p> <p>Another meeting of ANBAI was held with publishers in Indian Spinal Injuries Centre on 11th June, 2015 to discuss role of Elsevier in the consortia as Knowledge Partner, product Offerings by participating publishers, fund-pooling model, due diligence on Seats and Specialties forwarded by NBE and important dates and Follow-Up Action Points.</p> <p>The present status was that Consortia of Publishers was working on a suitable model for pooling of funds, ULR Committee of ANBAI had forwarded the Content List to the publishers, NBE would allocate a suitable space in their office</p>

		<p>for the ULR Office & the consortia of Publishers would share a suitable percentage of turnover to ANBAI towards meeting the expenses of manpower and recurring expenses</p> <p>The Points for Consideration included</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Fund pooling: whether it would be done by end-users or ANBAI members (Hospitals) • Ownership: who is going to take the ownership for collection of funds; whether we shall include a third party for the same • Agreement: whether the publishers would enter into an agreement with ANBAI or respective members • Content: exploring possibility of resubmitting the content for a revised selection.
	v	<p>News Letter</p> <p>The members were informed that ANBAI was planning to come out with a newsletter which would have messages from President, Secretary & Executive Director NBE, minutes of Annual General Meeting of ANBAI at Hyderabad with other details, write up on proposed Uniform Learning Resource, write up on “Health Ministry Underlines Equivalence”, details of National Board Awards, details of National Board sponsored workshops for Training of faculty & write up by a senior faculty member.</p>
	vi	<p>Academics</p> <p>Members were informed about the plan to request all cities to start local DNB clubs in each subject. This was already happening in OBG and ENT in Bangalore. Mr. Govind Hari proposed that Dr. Balraj could be made Advisor Academics. He could thus provide a support to the academic activities being overseen by Dr Padmaja. The members unanimously approved his suggestion.</p>
	vii	<p>ANBAI workshops and Symposiums</p> <p>The members were also briefed about the “National Workshop on Training of Faculty in Communication” as well as a Meeting in Bangalore in collaboration with AHPI, CAHO & others on “Capping on compensation for medical malpractice law suite in India”</p>
	viii	<p>Plan of Action for the coming year</p> <p>The plan of action for coming year included focus on Membership drive, academics at State Level, Uniform Learning Resource, liasing with NBE, liasing</p>

		with Government for parity of NBE & MCI courses & constitution of Governing Council of NBE at the earliest.
7	Treasurer's Report	
	Dr Kishore Babu presented the audited accounts statement. Bank balance as on 31/7/2015 was Rs. 5,51,045. The treasurer said that no money was collected from ANBAI institutes during the financial year. He appealed to all the institutes to contribute the yearly subscription of Rs 1000 per speciality per year (the amount which was discussed & unanimously agreed upon by all the members present). He also informed that the Auditor's fees had been reduced from Rs 50,000 to Rs 25,000.	
8	Any other point with permission of Chair	
	a	Nomination of Member to co-ordinate Research Activities
		There was a suggestion to nominate a member from Governing Council to coordinate the research activities of ANBAI. Dr. Ramesh from Ramesh Cardiac Centre, Vijaywada volunteered to take up this responsibility. Members unanimously approved this.
	b	Nomination of representative from Defence on the Governing Council
		It was also suggested to have somebody from Defence on the Governing Council of ANBAI.
	c	Membership Fee
		There was also a proposal to have a membership fee for ANBAI. It was suggested to levy Rs 1000 per speciality per institution as the membership fee. The members unanimously approved this.
	d	DNB Alumni
		There was another suggestion to nominate somebody to get the Alumni of the DNB going. Dr Suresh's name was proposed and was unanimously accepted.
	e	Venue of next Annual General Meeting of ANBAI
		The proposal to organize the next Annual General Meeting of ANBAI at New Delhi was unanimously approved.
9	The meeting concluded with a vote of thanks to the Chair.	
